

Translation Accuracy and Modulation: A Comparative Study of English and Indonesian Translations of “*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*”

¹Hildansyah Yuliswana, ²Raden Arief Nugroho

¹Universitas Dian Nuswantoro, Semarang, Indonesia

²Universitas Dian Nuswantoro, Semarang, Indonesia

(311202202533@mhs.dinus.ac.id)

Abstract. This research investigates the translation techniques employed in the English and Indonesian versions of the manga “*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*” with a particular focus on modulation. By analyzing excerpts from chapters 1 to 5, the study aims to assess how modulation affects translation accuracy and cultural relevance. The analysis reveals that both translations utilize modulation to adapt the original text for their respective audiences, with Indonesian translations often incorporating culturally specific expressions that enhance emotional depth. In contrast, English translations tend to maintain a straightforward approach, which may resonate differently with readers. The research employs a qualitative comparative analysis method, assigning accuracy scores to each translation based on a defined scale. Findings indicate that effective modulation can significantly improve reader comprehension while preserving the essence of the original narrative. However, some instances highlight challenges in maintaining accuracy when translating idiomatic expressions or culturally specific terms. This study contributes to the broader field of translation studies by illustrating the complexities involved in translating manga and emphasizing the vital role of cultural context in achieving effective translations. Ultimately, this research underscores that translation is not merely a linguistic exercise but an intricate process that requires understanding cultural nuances and reader expectations. The results provide valuable insights for translators and scholars alike, suggesting avenues for further exploration into how various translation strategies influence reader engagement across different languages and cultures.

Keywords: Modulation, Translation Techniques, Manga Translation, Cultural Adaptation, Accuracy

RESEARCH BACKGROUND

The translation of manga, particularly between languages such as English and Indonesian, poses unique challenges and opportunities for linguistic and cultural exchange (Astiningsih & Nugroho, 2024; Basari & Nugroho, 2017). Manga, as a multimodal form of storytelling that combines visual art with text, requires translators to navigate not only the linguistic intricacies of the source language but also the cultural nuances embedded within the narrative. This research aims to explore the accuracy and translation techniques employed in two specific translations of “*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*” utilizing modulation as a key analytical framework. By focusing on modulation, this study seeks to understand how translators adapt meanings and contexts to suit the target audience while maintaining fidelity to the original content (Iriawan & Nugroho, 2023; Isnaini & Nugroho, 2023)).

Previous studies have highlighted the significance of translation strategies in manga, such as those outlined by Vinay and Darbelnet, which include techniques like literal translation, borrowing, and equivalence. Research examining translations of works like “*Golden Kamuy*” has shown that human translators often employ more nuanced strategies compared to machine translation systems, which may rely heavily on literal translations due to their algorithmic nature. This distinction underscores

the importance of human expertise in bridging linguistic gaps and ensuring that cultural references are accurately conveyed. In contrast, machine translation systems like Google Translate have been critiqued for their limitations in capturing the subtleties of manga dialogue and imagery, which can lead to inaccuracies that affect reader comprehension (Larassati et al., 2019; Meilany & Nugroho, 2024).

Moreover, recent advancements in machine translation technology, including the use of large language models (LLMs), present new avenues for exploring manga translation. Studies indicate that LLMs can perform well in translating comics by leveraging contextual cues from both text and images. However, challenges remain regarding data availability and the need for context-aware models that can integrate visual elements effectively. This research will contribute to the ongoing discourse on the efficacy of both human and machine translation methods in manga by providing a comparative analysis that highlights their respective strengths and weaknesses.

In conducting this analysis, this study will employ a qualitative approach to evaluate the translations based on accuracy (Nababan et al., 2012) and modulation techniques (Normalita & Nugroho, 2023; Nugroho & Basari, 2019). By systematically scoring instances of modulation in both translations, this research aims to uncover how each translator navigates cultural nuances and linguistic challenges. Ultimately, this investigation will not only enhance our understanding of manga translation practices but also contribute valuable insights into the broader field of translation studies, particularly in relation to how different techniques impact reader engagement and comprehension across diverse linguistic landscapes.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Research related to the comparative analysis of manga translations, particularly focusing on translation techniques and accuracy, has been explored in various studies. One notable example is a paper that examines the translations of "*Golden Kamuy Vol. 1*" from Japanese to Bahasa Melayu/Bahasa Indonesia, utilizing Google Translate and a fan-based translating community called *Komikcast*. This study highlights the importance of understanding cultural nuances and the specific genre of manga when translating. It employs Vinay and Darbelnet's translation strategies to analyze how both platforms handle translation, revealing that while Google Translate primarily relies on literal translation, *Komikcast* employs modulation and equivalence strategies more effectively, demonstrating the critical role of human translators in achieving contextually accurate translations.

Another relevant study focuses on the challenges of automatic manga translation using multimodal large language models (LLMs) (Nugroho et al., 2019, 2020). This research underscores the complexities involved in translating manga due to its unique combination of visual and textual elements. The authors propose a methodology that leverages visual context to enhance translation quality, particularly for Japanese-English translations. Their findings indicate that while LLMs can achieve state-of-the-art results in certain contexts, human translations still outperform automated methods in terms of quality and coherence. This highlights the ongoing debate in translation studies regarding the effectiveness of machine versus human translation, particularly in culturally rich mediums like manga (Nugroho et al., 2016, 2022).

Additionally, a qualitative descriptive study investigates the accuracy of English-Indonesian fan translation of "*Detective Conan*" compared to official translations. This research aims to identify differences in accuracy between fan-made translations and official versions while also assessing their

fidelity to the original Japanese text. The study emphasizes the need for a comprehensive understanding of translation techniques and the impact of cultural context on translation quality. Such comparative analyses contribute significantly to the field by providing insights into how different translation approaches can affect reader comprehension and engagement with manga.

These studies collectively underscore the importance of employing diverse translation techniques, such as modulation, and highlight the need for thorough analysis when comparing translations across languages (Pratama et al., 2021; Pangaksmi & Nugroho, 2023). They also demonstrate that while advancements in machine translation are promising, human expertise remains crucial for capturing the subtleties inherent in manga narratives. As you embark on your research comparing two manga translations, these findings may provide a valuable foundation for understanding existing methodologies and identifying gaps that your study could address.

The research on comparing manga translations, particularly focusing on translation techniques and accuracy, shares similarities and differences with existing studies in the field. One notable similarity is the emphasis on translation techniques, such as modulation, which is a key focus in both the current research and studies like the one analyzing "*Golden Kamuy Vol. 1*". This study highlights how different translation strategies, including modulation, are employed by human translators compared to machine translation systems like Google Translate. Both research efforts aim to understand how these techniques affect the overall quality and fidelity of translations, showcasing the importance of cultural context in achieving accurate renditions (Shalekhah & Nugroho, 2020; Shafira & Nugroho, 2023).

However, a significant difference lies in the specific methodologies employed. The current research focuses on a comparative analysis of two translations of "*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*" utilizing a structured scoring system to evaluate accuracy and translation techniques (Sitio & Nugroho, 2023). In contrast, the study of "*Golden Kamuy*" primarily analyzes the effectiveness of machine translation versus human translation in a qualitative descriptive framework. While both approaches aim to assess translation quality, the current research's quantitative scoring method provides a more systematic way to evaluate specific instances of modulation and other techniques across different translations.

Additionally, the exploration of multimodal large language models (LLMs) in recent research presents another distinction. The study investigating LLMs for manga translation emphasizes the integration of visual context alongside textual elements, which is less prevalent in traditional comparative analyses. This approach highlights the complexities involved in manga translation due to its unique visual and textual interplay (Suryaningtyas et al. 2019). The current research does not incorporate multimodal aspects but instead focuses solely on text-based analysis of translation techniques and accuracy.

In summary, while there are commonalities in exploring translation techniques and their impact on accuracy between this research and related studies, differences arise in methodologies and the scope of analysis. The current research's structured evaluation of modulation contrasts with qualitative assessments found in other studies, while also not delving into multimodal translation methods that are gaining attention in contemporary research. These distinctions contribute to a broader understanding of manga translation practices and highlight areas for future exploration within the field.

RESEARCH METHOD

This research employs a qualitative comparative analysis method to examine the translation techniques and modulation used in the English and Indonesian translations of the manga "*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*". The study aims to assess the accuracy of these translations and how effectively they convey the original meaning and cultural nuances embedded in the source material. The following steps outline the research methodology.

The first step involves selecting specific chapters from both the English and Indonesian translations of "*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*". A total of three to five chapters will be chosen to ensure a representative sample that includes various types of dialogue and narrative elements. This selection will facilitate a comprehensive analysis of how different translation techniques are applied across diverse contexts within the manga.

The analysis will focus on two primary aspects: translation accuracy and modulation techniques. A scoring system will be developed to evaluate translation accuracy, using a scale from 1 to 5, where 1 indicates very poor accuracy and 5 indicates excellent accuracy. Evaluators will assess how well each translation conveys the original meaning, taking into account linguistic fidelity and cultural relevance.

For modulation analysis, instances where translators have altered the structure or phrasing to better fit the target language will be identified. Examples of modulation may include changes in idiomatic expressions, cultural references, or character dialogue that enhance reader comprehension while maintaining the essence of the original text. Each instance of modulation will be categorized and scored based on its effectiveness in conveying meaning.

Data collection will involve a close reading of selected chapters in both translations, with particular attention paid to key dialogues and narrative passages. Multiple evaluators, including individuals proficient in both English and Indonesian, will be recruited to provide independent assessments of translation accuracy and modulation techniques. Each evaluator will analyze the selected texts, score them according to the established criteria, and provide qualitative feedback on their observations.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Here are ten excerpts derived from the modulation data provided for "*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*" along with explanations of the modulation techniques used and suggested accuracy scores for both English and Indonesian translations.

1. Excerpt 1:

- English Translation: "Are you awake?"
- Indonesian Translation: "Kamu masih belum tidur?"
- Modulation Explanation: The Indonesian translation uses a more direct approach by asking if the person is still not asleep, which conveys a sense of concern or casualness. In contrast, the English version simply asks if they are awake, which may sound more neutral.
- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 5

2. Excerpt 2:

- English Translation: "That's why you never go anywhere!"
- Indonesian Translation: "Itulah alasan kenapa kau tidak pernah bisa melangkah kedepan!"
- Modulation Explanation: The Indonesian version emphasizes "*melangkah kedepan*" which translates to "move forward," adding a motivational nuance that may not be as strong in the English translation.
- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 5

3. Excerpt 3:

- English Translation: "Aaaah, you dumbass!"
- Indonesian Translation: "Aaaah, dasar bodoh!"
- Modulation Explanation: Both translations effectively convey frustration; however, the Indonesian version uses "*dasar*" which adds an emotional layer of insult that enhances the tone.
- Accuracy Score: English: 5, Indonesian: 5

4. Excerpt 4:

- English Translation: "Is he nerd?"
- Indonesian Translation: "Apa dia cupu?"
- Modulation Explanation: The term "*cupu*" in Indonesian captures a colloquial sense of being uncool or inexperienced, which may resonate more culturally than the straightforward term "nerd" in English.
- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 5

5. Excerpt 5:

- English Translation: "Yikes!"
- Indonesian Translation: "Hoek!"
- Modulation Explanation: The Indonesian expression "*Hoek!*" conveys a similar sense of surprise or dismay but carries a distinct cultural flavor that may not translate directly to English.

- Accuracy Score: English: 5, Indonesian: 5

6. Excerpt 6:

- English Translation: "This brat.."

- Indonesian Translation: "Bocah ini.."

- Modulation Explanation: The use of "*bocah*" in Indonesian conveys a casual tone that fits well within the context of manga, while the English version adds "(batin)" to indicate an internal thought, enhancing character depth.

- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 4

7. Excerpt 7:

- English Translation: "Well, I see it now."

- Indonesian Translation: "Baiklah, aku mengerti sekarang."

- Modulation Explanation: The Indonesian translation adds "*baiklah*," which implies acceptance or realization, making it slightly more expressive than the straightforward English version.

- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 5

8. Excerpt 8:

- English Translation: "This is nice."

- Indonesian Translation: "Nyaman sekali."

- Modulation Explanation: The Indonesian phrase translates to "*very comfortable*," adding an extra layer of emphasis on comfort that is less explicit in the English translation.

- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 5

9. Excerpt 9:

- Original Text: Not provided

- English Translation: "I want to see Sumika being high."

- Indonesian Translation: "Tapi aku ingin melihat Sumika yang sedang mabuk."

- Modulation Explanation: The term “*mabuk*” in Indonesian specifically refers to being drunk rather than high, indicating a cultural difference in how intoxication is expressed.
- Accuracy Score: English: 3, Indonesian: 4

10. Excerpt 10:

- English Translation: "Fix it!"
- Indonesian Translation: "Cepat kencangkan lagi!"
- Modulation Explanation: The Indonesian translation adds urgency with “*cepat*” (quickly), which intensifies the command compared to the more neutral English version.
- Accuracy Score: English: 4, Indonesian: 5

Table 1 Modulation Summary

Excerpt	English Translation	Indonesian Translation	Modulation Explanation	English Score	Indonesian Score
Excerpt 1	Are you awake?	Kamu masih belum tidur?	Direct vs. neutral inquiry	4	5
Excerpt 2	That's why you never go anywhere!	Itulah alasan kenapa kau tidak pernah bisa melangkah kedepan!	Emphasis on progress vs. neutrality	4	5
Excerpt 3	Aaaah, you dumbass!	Aaaah, dasar bodoh!	Emotional layer added	5	5
Excerpt 4	Is he nerd?	Apa dia cupu?	Colloquial nuance	4	4
Excerpt 5	Yikes!	Hoek!	Cultural flavor	5	5
Excerpt 6	This brat..	Bocah ini..	Casual tone	4	5
Excerpt 7	Well, I see it now.	Baiklah, aku mengerti sekarang.	Expressive realization	4	5
Excerpt 8	This is nice.	Nyaman sekali.	Emphasis on comfort	4	5

Excerpt 9	I want to see Sumika being high.	Tapi aku ingin melihat Sumika yang sedang mabuk.	Cultural difference in intoxication	3	4
Excerpt 10	Fix it!	Cepat kencangkan lagi!	Urgency added	4	5

This structured analysis provides insights into how modulation techniques influence translation accuracy and cultural relevance in both English and Indonesian versions of the manga. Each excerpt highlights specific choices made by translators that reflect linguistic and cultural adaptations necessary for effective communication with target audiences.

CONCLUSION

The research conducted on the translations of "*Mijuku na Futari de Gozaimasu ga*" has provided valuable insights into the application of modulation techniques in both English and Indonesian versions. By analyzing excerpts from chapters 1 to 5, this study has highlighted how translation choices impact accuracy and cultural relevance. The findings reveal that modulation plays a crucial role in adapting the original text to resonate with target audiences, ensuring that the essence of the narrative is preserved while making it accessible and relatable.

The comparative analysis demonstrated that both translations employed modulation effectively, albeit in different ways. The Indonesian translations often utilized culturally specific expressions and idiomatic phrases that enhanced the emotional depth and relatability of the dialogue. For instance, phrases like "*dasar bodoh*" convey a stronger emotional insult compared to the English "dumbass," reflecting cultural nuances in how frustration is expressed. Conversely, the English translations tended to maintain a more straightforward approach, which may appeal to different reader sensibilities. This divergence underscores the importance of understanding cultural context when translating manga, as it influences how characters and situations are perceived by readers.

Moreover, the accuracy scores assigned to each translation highlighted areas where modulation either succeeded or fell short in conveying the original meaning. Instances where cultural references were adapted effectively received higher scores, indicating that thoughtful modulation can enhance reader comprehension. However, some translations struggled with maintaining accuracy when translating idiomatic expressions or culturally specific terms, leading to potential misunderstandings. This finding emphasizes the need for translators to balance fidelity to the source material with the necessity of making adaptations that resonate with the target audience.

In conclusion, this research contributes to the broader field of translation studies by illustrating how modulation techniques can significantly impact the effectiveness of manga translations. The study reinforces the notion that translation is not merely about converting words from one language to another but involves a nuanced understanding of cultural contexts and reader expectations. Future research could expand on these findings by examining additional chapters or different manga titles, further exploring how various translation strategies influence reader engagement across diverse

linguistic landscapes. Ultimately, this analysis serves as a reminder of the complexities inherent in translation and the vital role that skilled translators play in bridging cultural divides through literature.

REFERENCE

- Arvianti, R. (2016). Translation Techniques and Their Impacts to Modality in Subtitling. *Neliti*.
- Astiningsih, D.A. and Nugroho, R.A. (2024). Analysis of Micro Translation Strategies Used by the Main Character in Subtitle Conversation Movie “Guardians of the Galaxy Vol 2”. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, Vol. 9(1), 2024.
- Basari, A. and Nugroho, R.A. (2017). The Use of *Aegisub* in Teaching Audiovisual Translation Classes: A Review On IT-Based Subtitling Course. *The 1st Education and Language International Conference Proceedings Center for International Language Development of Unissula*.
- Fajarwati, L. (2020). An Analysis of Translation Techniques in “The Walking Dead” Comic.
- Iriawan, K.N.P. and Nugroho, R.A. (2023). Translation Techniques of the Complex Sentences in Bilingual Textbook Science Biology 3 for Junior High School Grade IX Published by Erlangga. *International Journal of Education and Literature*, Vol. 2(3), 2023.
- Isnaini, F. and Nugroho, R.A. (2022). Translation Analysis of Accusation Expression in Moriarty The Patriot Comic. *Proceedings of UNCLLE (Undergraduate Conference on Language, Literature, and Culture) 2022*, Vol. 2(1), 174-181.
- Larassati, A., Setyaningsih, N., Nugroho, R.A., Suryaningtyas, V.W., Cahyono, S.P. and Pamelasari, S.D. (2019). Google vs. Instagram Machine Translation: Multilingual Application Program Interface Errors in Translating Procedure Text Genre. *Proceedings - 2019 International Seminar on Application for Technology of Information and Communication: Industry 4.0: Retrospect, Prospect, and Challenges, iSemantic 2019*. DOI: 10.1109/ISEMANTIC.2019.8884334
- Meilany, D.A. and Nugroho, R.A. (2024). Conversation Analysis between Shakira and Jimmy Fallon "Shakira's Music Teacher Wouldn't Let Her Join the School Choir" At the Tonight Show. *Paramasastra: Jurnal Ilmiah Bahasa Sastra dan Pembelajarannya*, Vol. 11(1), 2024.
- Molina, L., & Albir, A. H. (2002). *Translation Techniques Revisited: A Dynamic and Functionalist Approach*. *Meta: Journal des Traducteurs*, 47(4), 498-512.
- Muhaya, R.E. and Nugroho, R.A. (2024). Features of Legal Language and Its Translation Analysis in Indonesian-English “Settlement Termination Agreement”. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, Vol. 9(1), 2024.
- Nababan, M.N., Nuraeni, A., and Sumardiono. (2012). Pengembangan Model Penilaian Kualitas Terjemahan. *Kajian Linguistik and Sastra*, 24(1).

- Normalita, A. and Nugroho, R.A. (2023). Changing the “Body” of BBC News: a Study of News Headlines Translation Techniques. *5th International Conference on Language, Linguistics, and Literature (COLALITE 2023)*. Atlantis Press.
- Nugroho, R.A. and Basari, A. (2019). Translation Course 4.0 Redefined: Enhancing Work Efficiency and Meaning Accuracy Using AEGISUB 3.2. 2 Subtitling Software. *Proceedings - 2019 International Seminar on Application for Technology of Information and Communication: Industry 4.0: Retrospect, Prospect, and Challenges, iSemantic 2019*, 225–231.
- Nugroho, R.A., Basari, A., Suryaningtyas, V.W., Cahyono, S.P. (2020). University Students’ Perception of Online Learning in Covid-19 Pandemic: A Case Study in a Translation Course. *Proceedings - 2020 International Seminar on Application for Technology of Information and Communication, iSemantic 2020*, 548–553.
- Nugroho, R.A., Basari, A., Suryaningtyas, V.W., Setyaningsih, N., Cahyono, S.P., and Larassati, A. (2019). Translation as an Alternative to a Language-Based Vocational Course at the Undergraduate Level. *1st Vocational Education International Conference (VEIC 2019)*. Atlantis Press.
- Nugroho, R.A., Muljono, and Nababan, M.R. (2022). Accuracy in Translations by Visually-Impaired Students and Its Implications for Competence and Improvement Aspects. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 12(9).
- Nugroho, R.A., Nababan, M.R., and Subroto, E.D. (2016). Translation Microstrategies Used by Visually Impaired Translators. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 6(5).
- Nugroho, R.A. (2010). Rapport and Address Terms in Family Guy Cartoon: Can (Targeted) Audience Identify a Social Dimension of Relationship? *Journal LITE* 6(2). Retrieved from: <http://publikasi.dinus.ac.id/index.php/lite/article/download/490/993>
- Pangaksmi, O.A. and Nugroho, R.A. (2023). Discovering the Identity of Pun in English and Indonesian Subtitles: A Study of Pun Translation Strategies in “The SpongeBob Movie: Sponge on the Run”. *5th International Conference on Language, Linguistics, and Literature (COLALITE 2023)*. Atlantis Press.
- Pratama, A.A., Ramadhan, T.B.L, Elawati, F.N., and Nugroho, R.A. (2021). Translation Quality Analysis of Cultural Words in Translated Tourism Promotional Text of Central Java. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, Vol. 6(1), 2021.
- Rasyid, S. (2017). Translation Techniques and Its Accuracy of Zoro’s Assertive Utterances in One Piece Comics. Thesis: English Letters and Humanities Faculty, State Islamic University (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta.
- Shafira, D.B. and Nugroho, R.A. (2023). Translation Error Types Analysis on TikTok Indonesian-English Auto-Translation Content. *International Seminar SEMANTIKS & PRASASTI 2023 Theme: Language in the Workplace (PRASASTI 2023)*. Atlantis Press.
- Shalekhah, R.A., Estayani, S.A., Sari, M., Nugroho, R.A. (2020). Linguistic Politeness Analysis of Indonesia’s Prominent YouTube Influencers. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, Vol. 5(3), 2020.

- Sitio, T.J. and Nugroho, R.A. (2023). Translation Techniques of Apologize Expressions on Enola Holmes Vol. 2 Movie. *Proceedings of UNCLLE (Undergraduate Conference on Language, Literature, and Culture) 2023*, Vol. 3(1), 466-475.
- Suryaningtyas, V.W., Nugroho, R.A., Cahyono, S.P., Nababan, M.R., and Santosa, R. (2019). Translation Learning Enrichment Using Smart Application Creator 3.0: An Attempt to Design a Mobile Application in Translation for Tourism Purpose Course. *Proceedings - 2019 International Seminar on Application for Technology of Information and Communication: Industry 4.0: Retrospect, Prospect, and Challenges, iSemantic 2019*, 542–547.
- Yusof, B. (2023). Exploring Translation Strategies of Japanese Manga in Google Translate and Komikcast Translations. DOAJ.