

SUBTITLING STRATEGIES OF MULAN'S UTTERANCES IN THE INDONESIAN TRANSLATION OF MULAN (2020) DISNEY+ HOTSTAR'S MOVIE

¹Martsala Ikhtiari, ²Achmad Basari, S.S., M.Pd.

¹ Universitas Dian Nuswantoro, Semarang, Indonesian

² Universitas Dian Nuswantoro, Semarang, Indonesian

311202002273@mhs.dinus.ac.id

Abstract. This research is entitled Subtitling Strategies of Mulan's Utterances in The Indonesian Translation of Mulan (2020) Disney+ Hotstar's Movie. This study aimed to identify the subtitling strategies in the subtitles of the Mulan (2020) movie. The author employed a descriptive qualitative method to analyze the subtitling strategies of Mulan's utterances in the movie. The research focuses on English as the source language and Indonesian as the target language, employing Gottlieb's (1992) framework for classifying subtitling strategies. The analysis involved data collection, identification, classification, and concluding steps. The findings revealed 120 strategies corresponding to 120 utterances. The most frequently used strategy in Mulan's utterances was the transfer strategy, constituting 45 (37.5%) data, followed by the paraphrase strategy with 35 (29.2%) data, and the deletion strategy with 19 (15.85%) data. Strategies with less than a 10% rate included imitation strategy with 10 (8.3%) data, condensation strategy with 8 (6.7%) data, expansion strategy with 2 (1.7%) data, and transcription strategy with 1 (0.8%) data.

Keywords: translation, subtitling, disney+ hotstar, subtitling strategies, movie.

RESEARCH BACKGROUND

Language serves as a vital means of communication, essential for human interaction and societal development. Translation plays a vital role in enabling understanding across languages, particularly in the realm of entertainment. The entertainment industry, fueled by technological advancements and globalization, has seen a shift towards online platforms like Disney+ Hotstar. Disney+ Hotstar is a streaming platform that offers a diverse range of entertainment content from The Walt Disney Company and its affiliates. The venue results from a partnership between Disney and Hotstar, a popular streaming platform in India that was rebranded as Disney+ Hotstar. The service was launched as Hotstar in 2015 before Disney+ acquired Hotstar in April 2020.

The researchers discuss the subtitling strategy used in translating the Mulan 2020 Movie in this research. Mulan 2020 is a live-action adaptation of Disney's popular animated film of the same name. It became one of the main contents available on Disney+ Hotstar upon its release. This film is a live-action adaptation of the Chinese legend of Hua Mulan, falling into action, adventure, and drama. Directed by Niki Caro, with actress Liu Yifei in the lead role as Mulan. In the live-action version, the film attempts to provide a more severe and profound interpretation of the original Chinese legend. Unlike the animated version, there is no character Mushu in this film.

The researchers chose this film because it is an adaptation of the rich cultural and values-laden Chinese legend, where translators must preserve the nuances of the original language in their translations. "Mulan" 2020 features strong visuals and captivating action scenes, requiring translators to align the text accurately with the visuals. The film also incorporates technical and military language, necessitating the translators' precise handling of these technical terms. Additionally, considerations regarding how subtitling affects the viewer's experience are crucial.

Do subtitles assist viewers in understanding the story effectively? Do they preserve the original nuances and messages of the film? These are all essential points for a film translator. Therefore, the researchers selected the 2020 *Mulan* film as the research data, expecting that this study will provide valuable insights into how subtitling strategies are used to convey cultural messages, maintain fidelity to language and visuals, and influence the viewer's experience in the context of this meaningful film.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

This research focuses on subtitling strategies, examining two studies. In the first study by Simanjutak & Basari (2016), titled "Subtitling Strategies in Real Steel Movie," The researchers investigated the methods used in English to Indonesian subtitles and determined the most prevalent strategy in the translated subtitles. They used a descriptive qualitative method to analyze the subtitling strategies employed in the *Real Steel* movie. Results showed that not all strategies were used. The research reveals that 12 (19.35%) utterances utilized the Expansion strategy, 11 (17.74%) employed the Paraphrase strategy, 10 (16.12%) utilized the Transfer strategy, 10 (16.12%) employed the Imitation strategy, 1 (1.61%) used the Transcription strategy, and 18 (29.03%) utilized the Deletion strategy. The most employed strategy was Deletion, as observed through the absence of certain source language words in the target language.

The second study by Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), titled "Subtitling Strategies of Po's Utterances in Kung Fu Panda Movie," aimed to analyze the subtitling strategies used in the *Kung Fu Panda* movie. They employed a descriptive qualitative method, including data collection, identification, classification, analysis, and conclusion drawing. Transfer strategy was the most frequent (53.91%) in Po's utterances, facilitating easy translation of the source language into the target language. Conversely, Transcription had the least frequency (2.90%) due to its rarity in translating unusual terms in the source language.

Subtitling Strategies

Subtitling represents translations of the original text or spoken words into the target language. Their primary purpose is to facilitate the audience's comprehension of the film's content. Subtitling is presented in the same language as the film's dialogue, to assist viewers with hearing impairments or those with limited proficiency in the film's language. Gottlieb (1992) outlines ten subtitling strategies specifically designed for film subtitles, including:

1. 1. Expansion

Expansion enriches the target language by incorporating additional meaning, compensating for cultural nuances from the source language that may be absent in the target language. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of expansion is shown in the text below:

Example:

SL: I'm not like **the five**.

TL: Aku tak seperti *kelompok lima itu*.

2. 2. Paraphrase

Paraphrasing is employed when the phrase in the original or target language possesses a syntactic structure distinct from that of the source language. This approach is utilized to modify the subtitle's structure. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of a paraphrase is the text below:

Example:

SL: OK, **here goes**.

TL: Baik, *aku akan baca*.

3. 3. Transfer

Transfer involves a literal, comprehensive, and precise translation of the source text, without any supplementary explanations or visual alterations. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of transfer is the text below:

Example:

SL: **If he could read my mind, he will say, "What?"**

TL: *Jika dia bisa membaca pikiranku, dia akan bilang, "Apa?"*

4. 4. Imitation

Imitation involves translating the source text into the target text while preserving its original form, leading to an exact expression in the target language. Typically, this approach is used when translating proper nouns, such as names of people or places, and greetings. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of imitation is the text below:

Example:

SL: Master **Oogway** choosing the Dragon Warrior! Today!

TL: Guru *Oogway* memilih pendekar Naga! Hari ini!

5. 5. Transcription

Transcription is employed when dealing with uncommon terms in the source text, such as the utilization of a third language, unconventional language, non-standard speech, or words pronounced with particular emphasis on syllables. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of transcription is the text below:

Example:

SL: This is the greatest day in **Kung Fu** history! Just go!

TL: Ini hari terbesar dalam sejarah *Kung Fu*! Silahkan pergi!

6. 6. Dislocation

Dislocation is applied when the source language includes special effects, like a humorous song, where the translation of the effect takes precedence over the content. This approach is utilized when dealing with song lyrics and metaphorical elements. According to Subrata & Jumanto (2023), an example of dislocation is the text below:

Example:

SL: *What color of the sky? Ay mi amor, ay mi amor.*

TL: *Apa warna langit? Sayangku, sayangku.*

7. 7. Condensation

Condensation refers to shortening the original text during the translation process. This is done by condensing and simplifying the original text without eliminating the core meaning. Condensation helps to focus on essential information while removing elements considered non-essential. Thus, the condensation strategy helps achieve a more concise translation while remaining informative and clear. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of condensation is the text below:

Example:

SL: *He traveled the land in search of worthy foes.*

TL: *Dia berkelana untuk mencari musuh yang tangguh.*

8. 8. Decimation

Decimation represents an extreme form of condensation, often necessitated by the rapid pace of discourse. In this approach, even potentially significant elements are omitted, which can result in viewer confusion. Nevertheless, the essential meaning of the source text is still conveyed in the target text. This is particularly evident in scenarios involving the use of taboo words during heated arguments, fast-paced fight scenes, or speaking quickly. According to Sulistijani & Parwis (2019), an example of decimation is the text below:

Example:

SL: *The sooner we get this done, the sooner you move on.*

TL: *Semakin cepat selesai, semakin cepat pulih.*

9. 9. Deletion

Deletion aims to eliminate unnecessary or redundant parts of the original text while preserving its essential meaning. Deleted sections can be repetitions, question tags, and filler words from the source language to the target language. Deletion is employed to enhance the efficiency and clarity of the translated text by eliminating elements that might not contribute significantly to the overall message. The difference between condensation and deletion lies in the way original text elements are managed in the translation process, where deletion prioritizes the removal of elements, while condensation focuses more on streamlining and simplifying the text without eliminating the core meaning. According to Adinusa & Asmarani (2018), an example of deletion is the text below:

Example:

SL: I know. **I know**. You're right.

TL: Aku tahu. Kau benar.

10. 10. Resignation

Resignation refers to the approach taken when no viable translation solution can be identified. It is applied by translators when grappling with elements that are challenging to translate or intricate wordplay that resists straightforward interpretation. According to Subrata & Jumanto (2023), an example of resignation is the text below:

Example:

SL: **Que bueno**.

TL: -

RESEARCH METHOD

This study employed descriptive qualitative methods, chosen for their suitability in exploring uncertain variables and phenomena (Creswell, 2012). Descriptive research offers a systematic approach to comprehensively understanding specific research inquiries by providing detailed explanations of existing phenomena (Atmowardoyo, 2018). According to Sugiyono (2019), qualitative methods are employed in scientific research with specific goals, where researchers act as the primary instrument and data collection techniques are triangulated. Ary (2010) emphasizes the use of word and picture data in qualitative research. This study aims to identify subtitling strategies for Mulan's utterances in the Indonesian translation of the *Mulan* (2020) movie on Disney+ Hotstar. Therefore, it falls under the category of descriptive qualitative research, focusing on movie data and utilizing subtitling strategy classifications by Gottlieb (1992).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The researchers have identified Mulan's dialogues and categorized the use of subtitling strategies. Drawing on Gottlieb's (1992) classification of Subtitling Strategies, which encompasses ten types, namely Expansion, Paraphrase, Transfer, Imitation, Transcription, Dislocation, Condensation, Decimation, Deletion, and Resignation. Which are further explained in the table below.

Table 1 Findings of Data Analysis

Subtitling Strategies	Quantitv	Percentage
Transfer	45	37,5%
Paraphrase	35	29,2%
Deletion	19	15,8%

Imitation	10	8,3%
Condensation	8	6,7%
Expansion	2	1,7%
Transcription	1	0,8%
Total	120	100%

Based on the analysis of 120 utterances by the main character in the movie *Mulan* (2020), The researchers identified seven out of ten subtitling strategies outlined by Gottlieb (1992) in the Indonesian subtitles. Transfer was the most frequently used strategy, accounting for 37.5% of the total, with 20 instances. Other strategies included Paraphrase (15 instances), Deletion (10 instances), Imitation (7 instances), Condensation (6 instances), Expansion (2 instances), and Transcription (1 instance). No instances of Decimation, Dislocation, or Resignation were found.

1.1 The Classification of Subtitling Strategies in The Subtitle of *Mulan* (2020) Movie

These are the following examples of data analysis of the classifications of subtitling strategies in the subtitle of *Mulan* (2020) Movie.

1. Transfer

Transfer involves a literal, comprehensive, and precise translation of the source text, without any supplementary explanations or visual alterations.

Excerpt 1

SL: Don't panic.

TL: Jangan Panik.

In this scene, while *Mulan* is arranging her sister's hair, she notices a spider in her sister's hair. Seeing her sister's fear, she says, "**Don't panic.**" which was translated by the translator as "**Jangan panik.**" Based on the data above, the translator rendered the source language into the target language while preserving the original grammatical structure. The translator used the Transfer strategy. The translator translated the source language literally because the target language has a structure similar to the source language. Therefore, no modification or adjustment of meaning is needed in the translation, so the word **don't** is translated literally as **jangan** and **panic** as **panik**. The transfer strategy maintains the accurate purpose and ensures the message is clear and compelling in the target language.

2. Paraphrase

A paraphrase is employed when the phrase in the original or target language possesses a syntactic structure distinct from that of the source language.

Excerpt 2

SL: I will **squash** it.

TL: Aku akan **menyingkirkannya**.

In this scene, while she is arranging her sister's hair, she notices a spider in her sister's hair. Seeing her sister's fear, she says, "**I will squash it.**" which was translated by the translator as "**Aku akan menyingkirkannya.**" Based on the data above, the translator rendered the source language by modifying its grammatical structure in the target language for enhanced clarity. The translator used the Paraphrase strategy. The translator chooses this strategy because the word **squash**, when translated literally, means *memeras*, but the translator translates it as *menyingkirkan*. In this context, the translator considers the object referred to by the word **squash** to be a spider. Therefore, to clarify the intended meaning of the word **squash** in that scene, the translator chooses the word *menyingkirkan* instead of *memeras*.

3. Deletion

Deletion involves repetitions, question tags, and filler words from the source language to the target language.

Excerpt 3

SL: **But you know**, you can't really tell

TL: Tapi sulit menebaknya

In this scene, Mulan has just finished horseback riding and recounts to her family what she just experienced while riding. She and her horse, **Black Wind**, raced alongside two running rabbits. She recounted the rabbits and said, "**But you know, you can't really tell**" which was translated by the translator as "**Tapi sulit menebaknya**" Based on the data above, the translator rendered the source language by removing certain sections of the original text that the translator deemed potentially unimportant. The translator used the Deletion strategy. The translator chooses this strategy because the sentence **but you know, you can't really tell** when translated literally means *tapi kau tahu, kau tidak benar-benar bisa mengatakan* in Indonesian. However, the translator rendered it as *tapi sulit menebaknya*. In this context, the clause **but you know** was omitted in the translation because that clause is considered a filler word, and to ensure that the translation remains concise and adheres to the character length limit that can be displayed in the subtitle. It still conveys the essence of what Mulan is expressing to her family. Following the definition of deletion, this strategy removes repeated words, question tags, and filler words to make the text more concise or compelling.

4. Imitation

Imitation used when translating proper nouns, such as names of people, places, animals and greetings.

Excerpt 4

SL: **Xiu**, look at my face. What am I feeling?

TL: **Xiu**, lihat wajahku. Apa yang dirasakan?

In this scene, Mulan walks with her mother and sister to meet Madam Matchmaker. With heavy makeup on, she asked her sister, "**Xiu, look at my face. What am I feeling?**" which was translated by the translator as "**Xiu, lihat wajahku. Apa yang dirasakan?**" Based on the data above, the translator maintained the original form of the source language, resulting in an identical expression in

the target text. The translator used the Imitation strategy. The translator chooses to use imitation because **Xiu** is the name of Mulan's sister. According to the definition of imitation, this strategy preserves proper nouns, such as names of people, places, animals, and greetings.

5. Condensation

Condensation refers to shortening the original text during the translation process. This is done by condensing and simplifying the original text without eliminating the core meaning.

Excerpt 5

SL: Two rabbits running side by side.

TL: Dua ekor kelinci.

In this scene, Mulan has just finished horseback riding and recounts to her family what she just experienced while riding. She and her horse, Black Wind, raced alongside two running rabbits. Then she said to her family about those rabbits, "...two rabbits *running side by side*." which was translated by the translator as "*Dua ekor kelinci*." Based on the data above, the translator translated the source language using concise dialogue to eliminate unnecessary speech without losing the message and adhering to the character length limit that can be displayed in the subtitle. The translator used the Condensation strategy. The translator chooses this strategy because the phrase **two rabbits running side by side** when translated literally means *dua ekor kelinci lari berdampingan* in Indonesian. However, the translator rendered it as *dua ekor kelinci*. In this context, the phrase **running side by side** was omitted in the translation to simplify the conveyed message and make it more concise. The translation *dua ekor kelinci* still maintains the essence of what Mulan is expressing to her family: the presence of two rabbits running alongside her horse. This was done to maintain brevity and clarity in the translation as Mulan babbles while still preserving the central message of the conversation.

6. Expansion

Expansion enriches the target language by incorporating additional meaning, compensating for cultural nuances from the source language that may be absent in the target language.

Excerpt 6

SL: I think one was a male one was a female.

TL: Kurasa yang satu jantan, yang satu **lagi** betina.

In this scene, Mulan has just finished horseback riding and recounts what she experienced while riding with her family. She and her horse, Black Wind, raced alongside two running rabbits. She tells about the rabbits, and then she says to her family, "**I think one was a male one was a female.**" which was translated by the translator as "*Kurasa yang satu jantan, yang satu lagi betina.*" The translator added the word *lagi* in the target language based on the data above. The translator translated the source language by providing an additional term in the target language to clarify Mulan's statement. The translator used the Expansion strategy. The translator chooses this strategy because the sentence "**I think one was a male one was a female.**" when translated literally means "*Kurasa yang satu jantan, yang satu betina.*" without the word *lagi*. In Indonesian, adding the word *lagi* in the sentence is intended to emphasize the distinction between the two things being described. In this context, *lagi* indicates that more than one item is being discussed, one being male and the other being

female. In other words, the addition of *lagi* provides the nuance that an additional element is being discussed alongside the first one, emphasizing the comparison or contrast between the two.

7. Transcription

Transcription is employed when dealing with uncommon terms in the source text, such as the utilization of a third language, unconventional language, non-standard speech, or words pronounced with particular emphasis on syllables.

Excerpt 7

SL: You must hide your **chi**!

TL: Kau harus sembunyikan **chi**-mu!

In this scene, mulan accidentally unleashes her chi while fighting with honghui. When she realized this, she blamed herself and said, “you must hide your chi!” Which was translated by the translator as “kau harus sembunyikan chi-mu!” Based on the data above, the translator preserves the original counterpart in the source language, referred to as the original chinese equivalent. The translator used the transcription strategy. The translator chooses this strategy because in some cases, certain words or phrases may not have a direct equivalent in the target language or may not be easily translated into an equivalent single word. In this case, chi is a chinese term that refers to energy or vital force in the concept of chinese culture. Since there is no equivalent term in indonesian, the word chi is retained in the translation to maintain the overall concept that the word is intended to convey. This also ensures that the conveyed message remains accurate and does not lose its original meaning in the translation process.

CONCLUSION

The researchers successfully identified and categorized the subtitling methods used in the Indonesian translation of Mulan's dialogue in the film *Mulan* (2020) on Disney+ Hotstar. Gottlieb's (1992) classification of Subtitling Strategies, encompassing ten types, was employed, with seven utilized to interpret Mulan's speech from English into Indonesian. These strategies, including transfer, paraphrase, deletion, condensation, imitation, expansion, and transcription, were observed across 120 instances of Mulan's lines. Transfer was the most frequently used strategy, accounting for 37.5% of her dialogue, followed by paraphrase (29.2%), deletion (15.8%), imitation (8.3%), condensation (6.7%), expansion (1.7%), and transcription (0.8%). Notably, specific strategies like dislocation, decimation, and resignation were not employed in the analysis. Transfer dominated Mulan's dialogue translation due to its straightforward nature in accurately conveying the original meaning. Conversely, transcription, primarily used for unusual terms, was rare, representing only 0.8% of Mulan's lines, indicating its limited applicability in the movie.

REFERENCES

- Adinusa, H. P., & Asmarani, R. (2018). Subtitling Strategies of Po's Utterances in Kung Fu Panda Movie . *E-Structural (English Studies on Translation, Culture, Literature, and Linguistics)*.
- Ary, D. (2010). *Introduction to Research in Education*. Wadsworth: Cengage Learning.

- Atmowardoyo, H. (2018). Research Methods in TEFL Studies: Descriptive Research, Case Study, Error Analysis, and R & D. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*.
- Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism (Third Edition)*. Multilingual Matters.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*. Lincoln: Pearson Education.
- Gottlieb, H. (1992). *Subtitling. "A New University Discipline"*. In Dollerup & Loddegaard (eds). *Teaching Translation and Interpreting: Training, talent and experience*. Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Khalaf, B. K. (2016). An Introduction To Subtitling: Challenges and Strategies. *International Journal of English Language, Literature and Translation Studies (IJELR)*.
- Kreidler, C. W. (1998). Noah Webster's Linguistic Influences. *Language & Communication, v18 n2 p101-10 Apr 1998*.
- Simanjutak, N. V., & Basari, A. (2016). Subtitling Strategies in Real Steel Movie. *LITE*.
- Subrata, M. R., & Jumanto, J. (2023). Subtitling Strategies Used in Translating Cultural Words in The Subtitle of Disney Animation Movie: Coco. *Journal of Linguistics, Culture and Communication, 5*.
- Sugiyono, P. (2019). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan (Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Kombinasi, R&d dan Penelitian Pendidikan). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan, 67*.
- Sulistijani, E., & Parwis, F. Y. (2019). Strategi Penerjemahan Subtitling dalam Film "Ender's Game". *DEIKSIS*.